

TFTEI

Under the Convention on Long Range Transboundary Air Pollution

# Lessons learned in 10 years of cooperation on BATs in the UNECE region

*Tiziano PIGNATELLI*  
(former TFTEI Co-Chair)

---

*BAT Workshop 2024 – Paris, October 15-16, 2024*

# Lessons learnt in the past 10 years



## *Premise*

The Task Force on Techno-economic Issues (TFTEI), according to its mandate, is involved in activities in techno-scientific support of the EECCA countries, since many years. Recently the collaboration has been extended to the Balkan countries.

An overview of the experience of collaboration with the EECCA and Balkan Countries, in the past 10 years, is here presented, with a focus on the lessons learnt, in terms of what worked well and what could be improved.

# Key elements for a successful cooperation with the country experts



*According to the TFTEI experience, a number of elements are recognized as crucial for a successful cooperation:*

- 1) Efficient communication with the country experts
- 2) Technical meetings organized *in the countries*
- 3) Establishing personal friendly relationships with the country experts
- 4) Identification of relevant country experts in concerned sectors
- 5) Developing ad hoc studies on crucial sectors in the countries
- 6) Support from the UNECE Secretariat

# Efficient communication with the EECCA experts



Communication with the country experts is of the utmost importance and TFTEI (previously known as EGTEI), in 2010 introduced the simultaneous translation English – Russian in the TFTEI annual meetings, to facilitate the active participation of the Russian speaking experts.

To the extent possible, also some technical documents have been (informally) translated in Russian, along with some pages of the TFTEI web site..

The communication channel has been maintained open also beyond the meetings. Recently, a Russian speaking expert has joined the TFTEI techno-scientific board.

# Technical meetings with the EECCA/Balkan experts



Meetings have been organized in the EECCA Countries, with the significant support of the UNECE secretariat, both to promote the ratification of the Protocols in the EECCA Countries and also on specific subjects, i.e. VOC measurements.

A number of meetings, held in person, before the COVID pandemic are listed below:

*Assessment and measurement of emissions of volatile organic compounds - Integrated environmental permits – 11 and 12 November 2019 - Minsk, Belarus*

*Workshop to Promote the Ratification of Protocols of the UNECE Air Convention with Focus on Countries in the EECCA Region - 14 - 16 May 2019 - Berlin, Germany*

# Technical meetings with EECCA experts



- *Workshop with EECCA Countries, back to back with EECCA Coordination Meeting - 19 to 20 September 2018 - Saint Petersburg, Russian Federation*
- *Workshop in Saint Petersburg with EECCA Countries, back to back with EECCA Coordination Meeting – 19 – 20 October 2016*
- *Workshop on best available techniques, Berlin, Germany - 20 - 22 April 2016*
- *Workshop to promote the ratification of the protocols under the CLRTAP Convention across the entire UNECE region – Oslo - March 2014*
- *Facilitating the implementation and ratification of the protocols of the Convention on Long-Range Transboundary Air Pollution in Eastern Europe, Caucasus and Central Asia” March 19-20, 2013, Saint-Petersburg, Russian Federation*
- *Workshop to promote the ratification of the protocols under the CLRTAP Convention across the entire UNECE region – Murmansk – November 2012*
- *Development of the co-operation within the convention on long-range transboundary air pollution– St Petersburg 17 - 18 April 2012*
- *International Air Congress “Atmosphere — St Petersburg, 2011*
- *Join Workshop to promote the ratification of the Protocols on heavy metals, POPs and the Gothenburg Protocol across the entire UNECE region – St Petersburg 26-28 October 2009*

# Establishing personal friendly relationships with the country experts



Establishing personal and friendly relationships, to the extent possible, facilitates the creation of ideal conditions to have an easier, fruitful, reliable and stable collaboration with the country experts.

Efforts have been done to understand, from the perspective of the country experts, especially from EECCA experts, the needs, the difficulties and the obstacles they meet in the process of implementation of BAT, monitoring and regulatory systems.

# Identification of qualified country experts in critical sectors



In the perspective mentioned above, the identification of qualified country experts, who know in details the status of the technology penetration in several sectors, in their own countries, is absolutely essential.

At the same time, it is as well important that those experts are strictly in touch with the policy makers, at the Ministry level

The knowledge and the experience of those experts are determinant to develop ad hoc studies in their countries.



# Developing ad hoc studies on crucial sectors in the EECCA/Balkan Countries



Recently, TFTEI has successfully developed ad hoc studies in collaboration with the local identified experts, for a number of EECCA/Balkan countries.

The studies were aimed at developing the so called “*technological pathway*” toward the ratification of the Gothenburg Protocol.

The pathway is characterized by *BAT implementation* in the most crucial sectors, country by country, so to achieve the level of technology penetration, suitable to be in line with the Gothenburg Protocol provisions.

# What could be done better

Mainly because of lack or limited financial resources:

- 1) Only one training session, concerning VOC measurements, was organized in Belarus.
- 2) The difficulty in identifying a reference expert in each EECCA/Balkan Country, allowed till now, the development of the “Technological Pathway” analyses, in some countries, only.
- 3) Retrofitting and Environment impact analysis on an existing (old) Power Plant was carried out in 1 case only (the Apatity Plant, in RF).
- 4) Without the support of the UNECE Secretariat and other donors (UNEP, Parties, Industrial Associations) workshops like this could not be organized.
- 5) Limited number of EECCA/Balkan experts invited at TFTEI annual meetings, due to lack of resources.

# Conclusions

In the light of the activities carried out in the past ten years  
We can say that a number of actions have been successful

With the aim of achieving the ultimate objective to provide the countries with the best techno-scientific assistance, although considering the limits of the financial and human resources available, the following main questions are asked to the participants of this workshop:

*What could be done to further improve the interaction of the countries with the Task Force TFTEI ? Any suggestions ?*

# Lessons learned in 10 years of cooperation on BATs in the UNECE region



## Thanks for your attention

### Contacts :

#### *TFTEI Co-chairs:*

Cecilia Camporeale - [cecilia.camporeale@enea.it](mailto:cecilia.camporeale@enea.it)

Jean-Guy Bartaire [jean-guy.bartaire@citepa.org](mailto:jean-guy.bartaire@citepa.org)

#### *Techno-Scientific Board :*

Nadine Allemand [nadine.allemand@citepa.org](mailto:nadine.allemand@citepa.org)

Natalia Sirina-Leboine [natalia.sirina-leboine@citepa.org](mailto:natalia.sirina-leboine@citepa.org)

*Consultant :* Tiziano Pignatelli [tiziano.pignatellig@gmail.com](mailto:tiziano.pignatellig@gmail.com)